

greater legitimacy), or from specific capacities of the institution itself? How do the differences between consensus and unanimity decision rules influence decision-making? The consensus-capacity framework here gave some preliminary hypotheses about some of these elements, but much more remains to be done.

## **Appendix**

### **Event Selection Process**

This appendix describes the multi-stage process by which observations entered the main dataset used in Chapter 3.

#### **Fully Random Sampling for Pages**

The initial method of page selection was a fully random sample of pages. Microsoft Excel generated six sets of 400 random numbers between the page numbers comprising the first substantive page of the January 1994 issue and the last substantive page of the December 2003 issue. Ideally, a fully random sample would produce some but not excessive variation in draws across months and years. The initial criteria were 45-55% of valid page observations before December 1998 (the chronological midpoint of the sample), not more than ten months lost for no observations drawn, and also having moderate variation across months and years. Moderate variation here meant a ratio of not more than 1:1.5 between the lowest and highest monthly mean (across all years), and between the lowest and highest yearly mean (across all months).

These criteria reflect the realities of both international cooperation and data analysis. The meetings of many international bodies are highly cyclical. Oversampling particular months, or having too many months fall out of the dataset, risks biasing the

data in unpredictable ways. European vacation patterns mean that European institutions act much less frequently in August than in any other month; only the highest-profile items seem to disrupt the vacation period. In most summers, the primary CFSP decision-making body only meets two out of three months, and even then with an distorted agenda of high-profile items and items related to the change of presidencies which occurs each year on July 1. The EU's highest body, the European Council, meets in June and December, and frequently in March and September or October, so that meetings leading up to these summits are often occupied with preparatory matters rather than substance. Other international organizations have similar routines.

In addition, issues themselves may be cyclical. Conflict initiation is much less likely in the winter than in other seasons; hurricanes, cyclones, and other natural disasters which may require humanitarian aid are more likely in the summer months than at other times of the year. Coefficients related to institutions whose mandate or other characteristics make them more likely to respond to these types of cyclical events would be affected by samples which over- or under-sample cyclical events.

### *Selecting a Sample*

As mentioned above, I initially generated six fully random samples (FRS). To select the random sample with the best properties, I proceeded by determining how many months from each sample contained no observations. The fully random samples had a median of 4.5 months where no pages drawn fell within the month (range: 1 – 6). As this was promising, I began by investigating months which contained only one page

observation. The median number of months lacking observations rose to 9 (range: 5 – 11), but some samples were still promising.

I then proceeded to discriminate among the six FRS by examining the distribution of their observations more closely. FRS 6, which had lost the fewest months for lack of observations, had only 41% of its observations before the chronological midpoint. Since several hypotheses rely on the duration of membership/participation or the sequential joining of members, this amount of deviation seemed unacceptably high, and the sample was eliminated from contention. The two FRS with the lowest average variation across both months and years were FRS 5 and 1 (1.81 and 1.84, respectively), and these were subjected to further analysis. The selected pages in months with only two observations were coded to determine how many of these pages contained no observations and would thus risk eliminating the month from the sample. At this stage, the samples began losing months very rapidly, and the random sampling strategy was abandoned.

### **Stratified Sampling of Pages**

The failure of fully random sampling strategies to produce reasonably good samples led to the adoption of a stratified sampling scheme. This scheme relies on thousands of pages as the stratification unit. *Keesing's* does not have a set number of pages per month or year; indeed, the number of pages per month varies from 30 to 78,<sup>352</sup> and the number of pages per year varies from 563 to 743. Since thousands of pages do

---

<sup>352</sup> Total pages are always in multiples of four for publishing purposes, including the table of contents and index, which double as the front and back covers respectively. Here I count only substantive pages containing news briefs; this excludes the contents, index, and any advertising for other *Keesing's* products that the company inserts to reach the necessary multiple of four pages.

not coincide with chronological units, sampling by thousand achieves a fairly even spread of observations without forcing a specified number of observations per month or year.

Stratification occurred by having Microsoft Excel generate 450 three-digit random numbers (instead of the five-digit fully random but bounded values of above). Each of these values was assigned an ‘observation number.’ The three-digit numbers were then assigned sequentially to the thousands values included in the 1993-2003 range – 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, and 45 – to create a composite five-digit number.<sup>353</sup> This results in an equal distribution of observations across the thousands. Because the relevant *Keesing’s* page range was 39798 to 45762, however, some of the composed page numbers fell outside the range and were discarded.

While the two samples are not precisely comparable (largely as a result of the decision to include 1993 in the stratified sample and also to discard composed pages out of the desired range), the properties of the stratified sample were substantially better than those of the fully random samples. The stratified sample ties with FRS 2 for fewest observations lost as invalid pages. Observation distribution over the duration of the year was the best value of all seven samples. Distribution across years for a given month had a suitably low ratio of averages, though the presence of more observations in the later years increased the ratio of standard deviations. Because the number of pages that *Keesing’s* devotes to a year generally increases over time, the second half of the dataset contains approximately 52% of the observations. Eight months contain no observations. Since the within-month deviation exceeding desired levels can be explained largely as a function of

---

<sup>353</sup> 1993 was included for future use in a study of whether the change in institutions in November 1993 produces any effect on the probability of cooperation. It also ensures that the full range of 1994 pages is included in the center of the page range and does not risk truncation.

the thousands-based stratification scheme, and no other criteria were substantially outside the tolerable ranges, this sample became the basis for all further data collection.

### **Coding Rules for Qualifying International Events**

The purpose of the sample is to identify events or issues to which states or international organizations might respond by choosing to cooperate on foreign policy. The coding rules for identifying ‘qualifying international events’ (QIEs) reflect this purpose. I briefly describe the major coding rules below.

Instances of violence between states constitutes a QIE, as do efforts to settle such conflicts. Interstate tension of a political/military nature (i.e., not trade disputes) also qualifies as potential conflict. Strong norms for peaceful resolution of conflicts in the international system, and particularly among the types of international institutions studied in this project, make these prime targets for cooperation.

Internal conflicts qualify as well. Civil war, whether declared or undeclared, or an effort to settle such conflicts, constitutes a QIE. Similarly, I code reports of refugee flows, or efforts by the international community to intervene. Domestic unrest at a scale less than civil war can qualify as a QIE if rioting or demonstrations (related to non-economic issues) occur in which

- a) more than 25 people were killed, *or*
- b) the media present extensive reports of brutality or other human rights abuses by the authorities, *or*
- c) major political opposition figures are harmed, suppressed, or otherwise abused by the authorities, *or*

- d) the non-democratic government is reported to deem the scale and scope of the demonstrations or riots to be a threat to its stability.

National strikes are not QIEs unless they have a clearly non-economic motivation (i.e., they are political in nature) and meet one of the domestic unrest criteria outlined above.

Many of the institutions of interest in this project claim a particular interest in human rights. Major reported human rights violations thus constitute QIEs. I particularly code for reports of media suppression or violation of freedom of the press (Yugoslavia revokes all foreign journalists' visas, 1994; India bans six Urdu-language newspapers, 1995), and reported violations of religious freedom or important developments in church-state relations (e.g., Tajikistan bans religious parties, 1998). I also code instances of state behavior which indicate widespread lack of observance of human rights, particularly in the realms of due process and law enforcement restraint (e.g., the unprovoked killing of peasants by Brazilian and Mexican law enforcement officers in 1996 and 1995, respectively).<sup>354</sup> In addition, this category includes allegations of war crimes and crimes against humanity, and action on the basis of these charges in domestic courts.

Natural and man-made disasters also constitute QIEs. This includes humanitarian situations such the situation of refugees, famines and epidemics, earthquakes, hurricanes and floods, and the like, and also man-made disasters such as air or sea transit disasters killing more than 25.

Finally, QIEs include action by institutional bodies when those actions are not the result of direct interstate cooperation. This includes reports released by the Inter-

---

<sup>354</sup> Genocide is usually in the context of more widespread fighting and so entered the dataset under the internal conflict rules rather than human rights rules.

governmental Panel on Climate Change, the World Health Organization, and the UN Food Program. It also includes indictments from international criminal tribunals and decisions from other international judicial bodies. Reports from other blue-ribbon commissions are included if they have a distinctly international component. In this dataset, that includes the Vatican's report on Church behavior during the Holocaust (1998) and the Volcker Commission's report on the size and disposition of dormant (Holocaust-era) Swiss bank accounts (1999).

*Keesing's* entries do not conform to a uniform length. Longer articles have a greater probability of having their topic enter the dataset. That said, however, individual *Keesing's* entries can contain more than one QIE. For example, the seven-page entry about the start of the 2003 US-Iraq war contains separate QIEs about the US buildup in the Middle East, the formation of the 'coalition of the willing,' Hussein's missile launch that initiated ground combat, and several other elements. This strategy of locating multiple QIEs within a single entry helps to mitigate the effect of article length on the probability of a QIE entering the dataset.

### ***What is Not a QIE?***

Economic events, including budget announcements, mergers and acquisitions, and military purchases or contracts do not constitute QIEs. None of these types of news items are likely to provoke any response from other states. Loans from international financial institutions are excluded as well. These represent the outcome of cooperation already, and one which is filtered through an extensive chain of delegation, rather than an event or issue for potential response. Trade disputes and trade agreements are excluded as well.



Finally, diplomatic visits and the extension of diplomatic recognition do not constitute QIEs. These are most often bilateral interaction, and are also unlikely to provoke cooperation or, in the majority of cases, any reaction at all, from other states. A few high-profile exceptions may exist – for example, an Arab state recognizing Israel, or the North Korean leader visiting the United States or Europe – but no event which would strain this coding rule occurred on the sampled pages. Likewise, summits (bilateral or multilateral) are excluded.

### ***Distribution***

The minimum number of QIEs on a page was 0; the maximum number was 7. The median page contains two QIEs.

### **Event selection**

Pages containing no QIEs were dropped from the sample. Pages with only one QIE automatically had that QIE included in the dataset. For all pages with more than one QIE, Microsoft Excel generated lists of random numbers corresponding to the total number of QIEs on the page. Pages were then assigned to a random number in the order in which the page observations were drawn (not the order in which the pages occur). This ensures the preservation of the initial random characteristics.